IN THE SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA HOLDEN AT ABUJA ON THURSDAY, THE 11TH DAY OF JULY, 2024. BEFORE THEIR LORDSHIPS

HON. JUSTICE MOHAMMED LAWAL GARBA

HON. JUSTICE EMMANUEL AKOMAYE AGIM

HON. JUSTICE CHIOMA EGONDU NWOSU-IHEME

HON. JUSTICE HARUNA SIMON TSAMMANI

HON. JUSTICE MOORE ASEIMO ABRAHAM ADUMEIN

HON. JUSTICE HABEEB ADEWALE OLUMUYIWA ABIRU

HON. JUSTICE JAMILU YAMMAMA TUKUR

JUSTICE, SUPREME COURT

SC/343/2024

BETWEEN:

ATTORNEY GENERAL OF THE FEDERATION

PLAINTIFF

AND

- 1. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF ABIA STATE
- 2. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF ADAMAWA STATE
- 3. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF AKWA IBOM STATE
- 4 ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF ANAMBRA STATE
- 5. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF BAUCHI STATE
- ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF BAYELSA STATE
- 7. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF BENUE STATE

DEFENDANTS

- 8. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF BORNO STATE
- 9. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF CROSS RIVER STATE
- 10. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF DELTA STATE
- 11. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF EBONYI STATE
- 12. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF EDO STATE

Certified True Copy

REGISTRAR

124

- 13. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF EKITI STATE
- 14. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF ENUGU STATE
- 15. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF GOMBE STATE
- 16. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF IMO STATE
- 17. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF JIGAWA STATE
- 18. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF KADUNA STATE
- 19. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF KANO STATE
- 20. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF KATSINA STATE
- 21. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF KEBBI STATE
- 22. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF KOGI STATE
- 23. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF KWARA STATE
- 24. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF LAGOS STATE
- 25. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF NASARAWA STATE
- 26. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF NIGER STATE
- 27. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF OGUN STATE
- 28. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF ONDO STATE
- 29. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF OSUN STATE
- 30. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF OYO STATE
- 31. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF PLATEAU STATE
- 32. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF RIVERS STATE
- 33. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF SOKOTO STATE
- 34. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF TARABA STATE
- 35. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF YOBE STATE
- 36. ATTORNEY-GENERAL OF ZAMFARA STATE

DEFENDANTS

<u>JUDGMENT</u> (DELIVERED BY CHIOMA EGONDU NWOSU-IHEME, JSC)

My lord E.A. Agim, JSC obliged me with the draft of the lead judgment. The issues distilled for determination have been, characteristically and comprehensively resolved by his lordship. I entirely agree with the reasoning,

2

SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

18/2/24

conclusion, decisions and orders therein. I endorse and adopt them as mine.

I have painstakingly gone through the Preliminary Objections. I consider the various Preliminary Objections of the defendants as unmeritorious. The arguments relating to the Preliminary Objections have been very well captured and dealt with in the lead judgment. I need not enumerate them for I consider it unnecessary to do so. I accordingly overrule the Preliminary Objections.

On the merits of the substantive suit, it is my humble view that the unquantifiable and manifold merits have been exhaustively captured and dealt with in the lead judgment.

This suit was principally instituted by the plaintiff to curb the excesses of some recalcitrant Governors of States who run the Local Government Councils as part of their household or parastatals in their states.

This is a typical example where majority of Nigerians have approached this Court crying for justice. They are telling this Court that they want to use what they have

(the law) to get what they have been yearning for that is, Financial Autonomy of the Local Government Councils. We shall be failing woefully in our duties if we send them back without using the instrumentality of the law to wipe away their tears. We shall not use the 1999 Constitution of the Federal Republic of Nigeria to paint the picture of helplessness since the Constitution is meant for Nigerians and not Nigerians for the Constitution.

If we fail to take a firm decision now, there may never be another time or opportunity to do so. As Nigerians, we are not unmindful of the fact that our decision in this case will go a long way in providing succour to the down trodden while at the same time curbing the flagrant violation of our 1999 Constitution by majority of the defendants while they still use the same Constitution to make a mockery of the Financial Autonomy and Independence of the Local Government Councils.

It is noteworthy that majority of the defendants in this suit asserted that they have complied with the Constitutional provisions granting Fiscal Autonomy to the

Local Government Councils. As pleasant and heartwarming as this defence may sound, one then wonders why out of the 36 defendants not even one of them conceded to this action.

It is for all these and the unquantifiable detailed reasoning contained in the lead judgment that I adopt and agree completely with the entire reliefs enumerated by Agim, JSC in the lead judgment and hold that there is ample merit in the plaintiff's claim and I also hold that it succeeds accordingly.

CHIOMA EGONDU NWOSU-IHEME JUSTICE, SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA.

> Usman B. Bature Esq REGISTRAR UPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

COUNSEL:

Prince Lateef O. Fagbemi (SAN) Attorney-General and Minister of Justice) with him **Prof. Yusuf Ali (SAN)**; **S.T. Hon (SAN)**; **T.A. Gazali (SAN)**; Acting Director, Civil Appeals Department, Federal Ministry of Justice) and **O.A. Oloruntogbe**, **Esq.** (Assistant Chief State Counsel, Federal Ministry of Justice) for the plaintiff.

Ikechukwu Uwanna, Esq. (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Abia State) with him, **Mrs. Nkeiru N. Akinnola** (Director, Legal Services, Abia State Ministry of Justice); **Mrs. Ihuoma Omokwe** (Director, Abia State Ministry of Justice); **Mrs. Nkolika Ubani** (Senior Special Assistant to the Governor of Abia State) and Chinedu Amanamba, Esq. (Assistant Chief State Counsel, Abia State Ministry of Justice) for the 1st defendant.

A.K. Jingi, Esq. (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Adamawa State) with him **J.A. Waya, Esq.** (Acting Director, Civil Litigation, Adamawa State Ministry of Justice) and **Z.Y. Usman, Esq.** (Senior State Counsel I, Adamawa State Ministry of Justice) for the 2nd defendant.

Essien Essien Udom (SAN) and Emmanuel Enoidem (SAN) with him, Samuel Akpabio, Esq., Oluwole Akindutire, Esq. and Bassey J. Ekanem, Esq. for the 3rd defendant.

REGISTINAR SUPREME COUPY OF NIGERIA

Usman B. Bature Esq

Dr. Onyechi Ikpeazu (SAN, OFR, OON) and **P.I.N. Ikwueto (SAN)** with him **Julius Mba, Esq.**; **Nwamaka Ofoegbu, Esq.** and **Emeka Chinwuba, Esq.** for the 4th defendant.

Hassan Usman El-Yakub (SAN); (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Bauchi State) with him **M.U. Usman, Esq.** (Deputy Director of Public Prosecutions, Bauchi State Ministry of Justice) and **S.M. Toro, Esq.** (Chief State Counsel, Bauchi State Ministry of Justice) for the 5th defendant.

Emmanuel Yinfaowei, Esq. (Solicitor-General of Bayelsa State) with him **Lugard Tare-Otu, Esq.**; **Erebi Biboye, Esq.** (Principal State Counsel, Bayelsa Ministry of Justice) and **Michelle Zuokumor, Esq.** (Principal State Counsel, Bayelsa State Ministry of Justice) for the 6th defendant.

F.B. Mnyim (Attorney-Genera, I Benue State), with him, **E. Enyikwola** (Director Citizens Rights, Benue State), **Z.O. Onum, Esq.** (Assistant Chief State Counsel, Benue State Ministry of Justice) J.**T. Gwa**, (Assistant Chief State Counsel, Benue State Ministry of justice) and **E.N. Agoh** (Senior Chief State Counsel, Benue State Ministry of Justice) for the 7th defendant.

REGISTRAR SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA **J.J. Usman, (SAN)** with him, **Bulus Adamu, Esq.** (Director of Civil Litigation, Borno State Ministry of Justice) **C.O, Ogbu, Esq.**; **Asma'u Ahmed, Esq.**; **I.Q Abbey, Esq.**, for the 8th defendant.

Ededem C. Ani, Esq. (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Cross River State), with him **Anthony Effiom, Esq.** (Director, Civil Litigation), **Gregory I. Okem, Esq.** (Director Public Prosecution), **John Ogban, Esq.** (Director Appeals) and **Udenyi Omaji, Esq.** (Senior State Counsel I, Cross River State Ministry of Justice) for the 9th defendant.

Omamuzo Erebe, Esq. (Solicitor-General, Delta Sate Ministry of Justice) with him S. O. Monye, Esq.; (Director, Civil, Litigation), I.G. Eze-Owenze, Esq. (Director, Advisory Services); U.P. Okolotu, Esq. (Principal State Counsel) and O.B. Okonye, Esq. (Principal State Counsel, Delta State Ministry of Justice) for the 10th defendant.

Dr. Ben Uruchi Odoh (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Ebonyi State) with him **Israel Ikechukwu Alobu, Esq.**; **Ikenna Michael Nwidagu, Esq.** (Assistant Chief State Counsel,

Usman B. Bature Esq.

REGISTEAR EME COURT OF NIGERIA

Ministry of Justice) and **Sylvia Nnenna Nworie** (Senior State Counsel, Ministry of Justice) for the 11th Defendant.

Oluwole Oasaze-Uzzi, Esq. (Attorney-General & Commissioner for Justice, Edo State) with him Prof. Faith Osadolor (Solicitor-General, Edo State) and Dr. Solomon Agbonhulu, Mrs. Esosa Osula (DPPRS), Chukwuemeka Achugbu, Esq for the 12th defendant.

Dayo Akpata SAN (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Ekiiti State) wih him Gbemiga Adaramola, Esq. (Director Civil Litigation, EKiti State), Olalekan Suleiman, Esq. (AACLO, Ekiti State). O.M. Atibioke, Esq. and A.D. Adeleye, Esq. for the 13th defendant.

Dr. Kingsley T. Udeh (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Enugu State) with him **I.I. Eze** (Director Appeals), **Lilian Ogar** (Senior Legal Officer) and **C.V. Asogwa-Ugwueze** (Legal Officer) for the 14th defendant.

Muzzammil Yahaya, Esq. for the 15th defendant

Chief C.O.C. Akaolisa (Attorney-General Imo State and Commissioner for Justice) and **Mrs. Ifeoma Charles-Umeh**, for the 16th defendant.

Bello Abdulqadir Fanini (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Jigawa State) **Aliyu Abdullahi** (DDCL) and **Aliyu Hassan Hassan** (CSC) for 17th defendant.

Sule Shu'aibu, SAN, (Attorney-General Kaduna State) with him Jummai Adamu Dan'azumi, Esq. (solicitor General), Mohamed Tajudeen Mohammed, Esq., Salvation Zainabu Kyari, Esq. (Senior State Counsel) and Sadiya Nasir, Esq. (Senior State Counsel) for the 18th defendant.

Ahmed Raji, SAN, FCIArb. (U.K) with him Ibrahim Tukur Elsudi, Esq.; Bimbo Atilola, Esq.; Abdulkarim Maude, Esq. and Peter Nwatu, Esq. for the 19th defendant.

Ibrahim A.A. Esq. (Director Civil litigations, Katsina State) with him Lanre Ajetunmobi Esq.; Opeyemi O. Adeyemi, Esq.; Khalil O. Ajana, Esq.; Taofeek Yahaya, Esq.; Ibrahim A.

REGISTRAR SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

Usman B. Bature Esq

Saleh, Esq.; I.O. Adedoyin, Esq. and **W.G, Adekanye, Esq.,** for the 20th defendant.

Olanrewaju Osinaike for the 21st defendant.

J.B. Daudu, SAN, FCIArb. (U.K) and A.M. Aliyu, SAN; with him Ibrahim Sani Muhammad, SAN, Aliyu O. Saiki, SAN, Adedayo Adedeji. SAN and P.B. Daudu Esq. for the 22nd defendant.

Senior Ibrahim Sulyman, Esq. (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Kwara State) with him A.M. BELLO, Esq. (Director Civil Litigaiton, Kwara State Ministry of Justice), Isiaq Abdulrasheed Olorundare, Esq. (State Counsel I, Kwara State Ministry of Justice) and Hussein Afolabi, Esq. for the 23rd Defendant.

S.M. Labaran, Esq. (Hon. Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Nasarawa State) with **Y.Y, Ede, Esq.** (Director Civil Litigation); **E.U. Aliyu, Esq.** (Deputy Director Legal Drafting); **M. J, Abokee, Esq.** (Deputy Director Law Reform); **B.A. Jankat, Esq.** and **F.A. Tunga, Esq.**, for the 25th defendant.

Cestified True Copy

Alsman B. Bature Esq

REGISTRAR

SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

18 7 24

J.J. (SAN) with him, **M.S. Abdul-Aziz, D.O. Atita, Esq., I. U. Ujah** and N.U, Usman, Esq. for the 26th defendant.

Kehinde Ogunwumiju, OFR, SAN, FCIArb. With him O.M. Atoyebi, SAN; Tunde Afe-Babalola, SAN, FCIArb.; Eko Ejembi Eko, SAN; Opemipo Owotumi, Esq.; Opemipo Osunleti, Esq.; Teslim Tobatele Giwa Esq., and D.D. Anyanwu, Esq., for the 27th defendant.

Dr. Olukayode Ajulo, OON (SAN); Emmanuel Patrick Esq.; Eniola Oyelami; Margaret Aguocha; Lasisi Hammed; Michael Okejimi and O.F. Bosun-Kwadjo (P.L.O.) for the 28th defendant.

Olu-wole Jimi-Bade, Esq.; John E. Opaluwa, Esq.; Nurudeen Hakkem, Esq. and Jide Obisakin, Esq., for the 29th defendant.

Abiodun Aikomo (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Oyo State) with him, **N.A. Abiola** (Director Legal Drafting

REGISTRAR SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

YUsman B. Bature Esq

and Ministerial Counseling) and **Adeola Ige Adeleke** (Assistant Chief State Counsel) for the 30th Defendant.

P.A. Dafi (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Plateau State) with him **J.I. Mantu, Esq.** (Assisant Director, Plateau State Ministry of Justice), for 31st Defendant.

I.D. Iboroma, SAN (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Rivers State) with him Ibiwari Clapton-Ogolo, Esq.; Uzor Ikenga, Esq.; R.O. Adakole, Esq.; Cfmc, U.P. Ogo, Esq. and T.C. Shalom, Esq., for the 32nd defendant.

Mohammed Nasiru Binji, Esq. (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Sokoto State) with him **L.S. Wali, Esq.** (Director Civil Litigation) and **Amanzi F. Amanzi, Esq.** for the 33rd Defendant.

G.A. Idiagbonya, Esq. with him, **Mrs. P.N. David** (Principal state Counsel, Taraba State Ministry of Justice) for the 34th defendant.

REGISTRAR
SUPREME COURT OF NIGERIA

Saleh Samanja (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Yobe State) with him **Baba Dala Fika, Esq.; Isma'il Usman, Esq.** and **Muhammad S. Dan'azumi** for the 35th defendant.

Abdulaziz Sani SAN (Attorney-General and Commissioner for Justice, Zamfara State) with him **Mustapha Aikawa, Esq.** for the 36th defendant.